



Vehicle Value Experts

"No One Else Comes Close"

November 30, 2015

Mr.XXXXX Gillispie
6358 XXXXX Road
Kaufman, Texas 75142
Mobile Number: 000-994-7949
Email: XXXorkliftinc@gmail.com

Re: 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab 4X2 Diesel 169" Laramie Longhorn Edition
Vehicle Identification Number 3C63RPKL0EG251260 Mileage 38,022
CCC ONE Total Loss Analysis

Foremost Insurance Group
Claim Reference: 9999942375-1-2
Policy Number: 00000059034

CCC ONE MARKET VALUATION REPORT
Report Reference Number: 56116984
Loss Incident Date: November 1, 2015

Dear Mr. Gillispie

REDACTED

I have reviewed in detail the CCC ONE Market Valuation Report (see Exhibit A, CCC ONE Market Valuation Report) you provided me for the above-referenced claim. The Report attempts to outline and support a Market Value Replacement (Adjusted Vehicle Value) on the above-referenced Vehicle (2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab 4X2 Diesel 169" Laramie Longhorn Edition) of \$44,347.00. CCC ONE carefully selected at their sole discretion five (5) mismatched 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 models to arrive at their sole opinion and support said CCC ONE Market Valuation Report Methodology. I will expand on this in detail along with other infractions of the CCC ONE Market Valuation Report further into the analysis.

There is no Scientific Data to support said Market Value computation used by CCC ONE and is merely a scheme to decrease Total Loss Compensation Paid to Total Loss Victims. [Emphases mine]

It is our Professional Opinion the Fair Market Value (see Exhibit P, Certified Appraisal) on the above-referenced One-Owner 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab 4X2 Diesel 169" Laramie Longhorn with Dodge Ram Certified Pre-Owned Status is \$53,900.00. In addition to 6.25 %, Sales Tax of \$3,306.25 and applicable State, County, Municipal Fees and Taxes for \$116.25 are due to as well.

The Fair Market Value Settlement for this Claim including Sales Tax and Registration Fees should, in fact, be \$56,322.50. I will support this assumption in the concise overview outlined below.



1310 1st Street
Vidor, Texas 77662
409-790-4378

Robert@VehicleValueExperts.com
www.VehicleValueExperts.com

OVERVIEW:

CARFAX, NADA., and Kelley Blue Book are a trusted and objective resource in Motor Vehicle Data Mining and Management, they are heavily relied on not only by consumers during and prior to their vehicle purchase for accurate and up to date Motor Vehicle History Information but are counted on and entrusted by Auctions; Manufacturers; Dealers; Insurance Agencies; Appraisal Agencies; Government Entities, Lenders and Financial Institutes alike as an invaluable tool for asset management. As a matter of fact, N.A.D.A. Used Car Guide had its origins in 1922, five years after Dealers formed NADA when the association began studying used-car values at the U.S. Government's request. N.A.D.A. and Kelley Blue Book Market Values are comprised of and arrived at by millions of actual retail and wholesale factual documented transactions, including Manheim Dealer to Dealer Auction Data to arrive at their respected Fair Market Vehicle Values. N.A.D.A. and Kelley Blue Book are the most reliable and relevant Motor Vehicle Pricing Tool in the industry. Consumers in Today's Market Place before buying a Pre-Owned vehicle will routinely, if not always, "*Ask for the CARFAX*" before making their buying decision and will always base and support their purchase price from the information contained in the CarFax Report. Astute and Reputable Motor Vehicle Dealers will always purchase CarFax Reports prior to purchasing and/or trading for a Vehicle and unequivocally understand they are liable for not reporting and/or disclosing damage and/or Title Issues and/or irregularities to the vehicle as well as satisfying any manufacturer open recalls on the vehicle prior to the Retail Sale of such vehicle. In the Astute and Reputable Motor Vehicle Dealers eyes, the CarFax Report discloses and outlines Prior Wreck Damage; Accidents involving the Vehicle; Mechanical Deficiencies; Service Records; Mileage Discrepancies; Title Errors and/or Brands on Title and will list any Open Manufacturer Recalls. Vehicles with a less than perfect CarFax Reports will always sell for less than the Fair Market Value Price and in most cases are precluded from gaining Certified Pre-Own Statues by the Manufacturer of said Make Franchise Dealer. Most always a Lender will shy away from advancing money against a vehicle with a BAD CARFAX REPORT. Lenders undeniably use CarFax, N.A.D.A., and Kelley Blue Book as a reliable tool to value the vehicle before Loaning Money against the Collateral.

J.D. POWER McGraw Hill Financial dba Mitchell a Leading National Motor Vehicle Market Valuation Firm, who primarily engages in Motor Vehicle Valuation Reports for Insurance Companies, purchased (see Exhibit B, July 1, 2015, Press Release) NADA Used Car Guide several months back expanding its Analytics and Modeling Capabilities in the Used Vehicle Industry. As noted by J.D. POWER "The acquisition of NADA Used Car Guide expands J.D. POWER's analytical and modeling capabilities, deepening its presence in auto finance and auto insurance and enriching retail solutions," said Douglas L. Peterson, president and chief executive officer of McGraw Hill Financial. "J.D. Power's impressive breadth of automotive benchmarking, and analytical and advisory services, ideally positions it to create unique market intelligence with unparalleled value by combining NADA used-car analytics with PIN's extensive new-car retail and pricing capabilities."

Kelley Blue Book, best known for its used-vehicle values (Kelley Blue Book values are powered by millions of retail and wholesale transactions, including Manheim auction data) and Autotrader, an online vehicle shopping site several months back merged (see Exhibit C, Cox merges Autotrader.com and KBB) to create Cox Automotive Media.

Cox Automotive President Sandy Schwartz was quoted, "Together, Autotrader and Kelley Blue Book garner more consumer recognition, more shoppers and deliver more advertiser value than any other third-party automotive site. More than 65 percent of all shoppers visit Autotrader.com or KBB.com during the shopping process." Jared Rowe, President of the newly minted Cox Automotive Media President, was quoted, "Capitalizing on each unit's brand equity, Autotrader and Kelley will maintain distinct websites and market positions but share data and resources." Cox Automotive is a leading provider of digital marketing, wholesale and e-commerce solutions across the automotive industry. The company partners with more than 40,000 dealers, as well as major automobile manufacturers, and touches car buyers in the U.S. with the most recognized brands in the industry.

N.A.D.A., Kelley Blue Book, and CARFAX are a global marketing information company that warehouses accurate real-time automotive information based on the collection of daily new-and-used vehicle transactions. Simply put N.A.D.A., Kelley Blue Book and CARFAX have a wealth of data and information you can't get anywhere else. [Emphases mine]

Dodge Certified Pre-Owned (see Exhibit D1, Dodge Certified Pre-Owned Brochure) questions most definitely come into account on collision damage repaired vehicles. The Dodge Certified Pre-Owned 125-Point Vehicle Inspection Checklist Eligibility (see attached Exhibit D2, Dodge Certified Pre-Owned 125-Point Vehicle Inspection Checklist) highlights the Vehicle Inspection Points. The Dodge Certified Pre-Owned 125-Point Vehicle Inspection Checklist as part of the validity specifically requirements requires the Technician to sign off on each inspection point as well as the Manager, and then, in addition, requires the New Prospective Buyer to sign the inspection sheet as well, fully agreeing with all items and/or irregularities as stated.

According to a recent J.D. Power and Associates study, sales of certified used cars and trucks have increased 46 percent since 2000. For many people, certified used cars and trucks have become affordable alternatives to new vehicles. By "certified used" or "certified pre-owned," we mean used vehicles that are offered for sale by your local dealer and feature warranties that extend beyond the initial "when new" coverage. Also Certified, Pre-Owned Models are offered special financing incentives.

To qualify for the definition of a "Certified Pre-Owned" vehicle, the warranty must be backed by the original vehicle manufacturer. The original manufacturer of the vehicle is using its dealer network to inspect the car, determine if it is worth certifying and then offer support for the vehicle for a period beyond the original warranty. Not all used vehicles can qualify for certified pre-owned programs, and terms vary from one brand to the next, but any true certified pre-owned program will include at least a 100-point inspection of the vehicle as well as a CarFax Report. If problems are found, the factory-trained technicians will fix it or disqualify the vehicle from the program. The certified warranty protection typically takes effect when the original warranty expires and, like a new vehicle warranty offers coverage for a certain number of years or miles, whichever comes first.

The benefits of purchasing a certified pre-owned vehicle versus a used vehicle from a private party or an independent used vehicle lot are obvious. You have the factory standing behind the

certified pre-owned vehicle, plus you'll be buying a vehicle that the original manufacturer has inspected to ensure that it is worthy of certification. The only downside to certified pre-owned vehicles is that they are more expensive than other used vehicles. However in most cases Certified Pre-Owned Vehicles qualify for special financing incentives. But in this case, the benefits of a Certified Pre-Owned Vehicle may outweigh the cost for many buyers, the peace of mind alone in purchasing a Certified Pre-Owned Vehicle is enough to justify the extra cost. Attractive finance options on Certified Pre-Owned Vehicles will always come into play as a bonus. *Retrieved from www.edmunds.com*

SUMMARY:

On October 2, 2015, the above referenced 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab 4X2 Diesel 169" Laramie Longhorn Edition was purchased Brand New with 36 miles on the odometer from Bonham Chrysler Dodge Jeep in Bonham Texas for \$61,500.00 plus Tax, Title, and License. Exhibit E1 is the Texas Department of Motor Vehicles Receipt evidencing the Final Purchase Price after Rebate was \$61,500.00, and the actual mileage was 36. Exhibit E2 is the Manufacturers Options Report on the above referenced 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab 4X2 Diesel 169" Laramie Longhorn Edition Vehicle Identification Number 3C63RPKL0EG251260. Exhibit E3 is the Original Manufacturers Invoice Cost (\$59,777.00) and Manufacturers Suggested Retail Price (MSRP) (\$65,855.00) with all standard equipment and options for the above referenced 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 4X2 Crew-Cab Diesel 169" Laramie Longhorn Edition. Exhibit E4 is the Detail Service Records on the above-referenced Ram. Exhibit 5 is the invoice for New Tires Purchased in June of 2015 along with a New Front Grill. It should be noted the above-referenced Ram has a Dealer Installed Gooseneck/5th Wheel Hitch Assembly and Bed Mounted Toolbox estimated value of \$1,800.00.

Date of Loss was November 1, 2015. Mileage was 38,022.

Exhibit F is the Dodge Ram Vehicle Identification Number (VIN) Decoding Information. Listed below is the subject Dodge Ram Vehicle Identification Number (VIN) Decoded. Position 1-3 World Manufacturer Identifier **3C6** (Chrysler de Mexico Truck), Position 4 Brake System & Gross Vehicle Weight (GVWR) **3** (Hydraulic- 10,001-14,000 lbs.), Positions 5-7 defines Brand, Marketing Name, Drive Wheels, Cab/Body Type, Drive Position, and Prices Series **RPK** (2WD Crew-Cab Lon Bed Longhorn Edition), Position 8 Engine **L** (6.7 Liter 6 Cylinder Diesel), Position 9 Check Digit **0** (0 through 9 or X), Position 10 is Model Year **E** = 2014. The above referenced Vin Code is 3C63RPKL0E which translates to 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab 4X2 6 Cylinder Diesel Laramie Longhorn Edition 169".

N.A.D.A. Bookout Evaluation for a 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 4X2 Crew-Cab Diesel 169" Laramie Longhorn Edition with Certified Pre-Owned status as of November 2015 (see Exhibit G) with mileage of 35,001 to 40,000 on the odometer reflects an actual Retail Value of \$49,450.00. After reviewing all documents and service records provided to us as well as the CarFax Report in Exhibit I, it is our professional opinion the above referenced Dodge Ram would without a doubt have the Dodge Pre-Owned Certified Status and subject to such value as well as replacement value computation about said settlement value.

Kelley Blue Book reflects a Non-Certified 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 4X2 Crew-Cab Diesel 169” Laramie Longhorn Edition as of November 29, 2015, as having a Suggested Retail Value (see Exhibit H1, Reasonable Market Value) of \$50,415.00. Kelley Blue Book Certified Pre-Owned Retail Value (see Exhibit H2, Suggested Retail Breakdown) as of November 29, 2015, shows \$51,265.00, with a Fair Market Range of between \$49,233.00 and \$53,296.00 for a Certified Pre-Owned 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 4X2 Crew-Cab Diesel 169” Laramie Longhorn Edition. Kelley Blue Book Auction Summary as of 11/29/2015 for a 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 4X2 Crew-Cab 169” Laramie Longhorn Edition with 38,022 miles has a Dealer to Dealer Auction (Wholesale) Value of \$45,691.00. After reviewing all documents and service records provided to us as well as the CarFax Report in Exhibit I, it is our professional opinion the above referenced Dodge Ram would without a doubt have the Dodge Pre-Owned Certified Status and subject to such value as well as replacement value computation about said settlement value.

Exhibit I is the CARFAX Report dated November 24, 2015, on the above-referenced vehicle (Your 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab 4X2 Diesel 169” Laramie Longhorn Edition) currently reflecting a 1 Owner “No Accident/Damage Reported to CarFax...12 Service Records Available... At least 1 Open Recall with a 31,554 Last Reported Odometer Reading,” worth \$1,580.00 Above Retail Book Value with an Adjusted Retail Value of \$51,030.00. CarFax Adjusted Retail Value of \$51,030.00 does not take into account the Truck has been deemed a Total Loss by Foremost Insurance.

Autotrader Currently (November 2015) has Fifty-Five (55) 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab Diesel 169” Laramie Longhorn Edition Models listed For Sale (see Exhibit J, Autotrader 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab Diesel 169” Laramie Longhorn Edition Models within a 500-mile radius of Kaufman Texas) within a 500-mile radius of Kaufman Texas. Each of the Fifty-Five (55) 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab Diesel 169” Laramie Longhorn Edition Models available is (4X4) Four Wheel Drive and several are Mega-Cab Models. Autotrader as of November 27, 2015, does not list For Sale within a 500-mile radius of Kaufman Texas a 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab Diesel 169” Laramie Longhorn Edition in (4X2)Two Wheel Drive.

AUTOTRADER COMPARABLE J1: Comparable J1A is a One-Owner 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab 4X4 Diesel 169” Laramie Longhorn Edition. Comparable J1A Listing Dealer is Hoyte Dodge Ram Chrysler Jeep (see Exhibit J1A) in Sherman Texas. Hoyte Dodge Ram Chrysler Jeep has the One-Owner 2014, Dodge Ram, 3500 Crew-Cab 4X4 Diesel 169” Laramie Longhorn Edition Listed For Sale at \$53,980.00 with 22,687 actual miles. Exhibit J1B is the Original Manufacturers Invoice Cost (\$59,478.00) and Manufacturers Suggested Retail Price (MSRP) (\$65,250.00) with all standard equipment and options for the above referenced 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab 4X4 Diesel 169” Laramie Longhorn. NADA Certified Pre-Owned Retail Value (see Exhibit J1C) for 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab 4X4 Diesel 169” Laramie Longhorn Edition Model is \$54,350.00. CarFax reports (see Exhibit J1D) the One-Owner 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab 4X4 Diesel 169” Laramie Longhorn Edition with a GREEN CHECK... No Accident/Damage is Reported, 1 Owner, with 4 Service Records and At Least 1 Open Recall, Worth \$540.00 Above Retail Book Value. CarFax Adjusted Retail is \$54,890.00. Comparable J1, Vehicle Identification Number:J3C63RRK LXEG287307 Mileage: 22,687

AUTOTRADER COMPARABLE J2: Comparable J2A is a One-Owner 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab 4X4 Diesel 169" Laramie Longhorn Edition. Comparable J2A Listing Dealer is Atascosa Dodge (see Exhibit J2A) in Pleasanton Texas. Atascosa Dodge has the One-Owner 2014, Dodge Ram, 3500 Crew-Cab 4X4 Diesel 169" Laramie Longhorn Edition Listed For Sale at \$52,988.00 with 18,364 actual miles. Exhibit J2B is the Original Manufacturers Invoice Cost (\$61,514.00) and Manufacturers Suggested Retail Price (MSRP) (\$67,645.00) with all standard equipment and options for the above referenced 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab 4X4 Diesel 169" Laramie Longhorn. NADA Certified Pre-Owned Retail Value (see Exhibit J2C) for 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab 4X4 Diesel 169" Laramie Longhorn Edition Model is \$54,825.00. CarFax reports (see Exhibit J2D) the One-Owner 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab 4X4 Diesel 169" Laramie Longhorn Edition with a GREEN CHECK... No Accident/Damage is Reported, 1 Owner, with 7 Service Records and At Least 1 Open Recall, Worth \$810.00 Above Retail Book Value. CarFax Adjusted Retail Value is \$55,635.00.
Comparable J2, Vehicle Identification Number:3C63RRKL6EG245524 Mileage: 18,364

AUTOTRADER COMPARABLE J3: Comparable J3A is a One-Owner 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab 4X4 Diesel 169" Laramie Longhorn Edition. Comparable J3A Listing is a Private Seller (see Exhibit J3A) in Plantersville Texas. Private Seller has the One-Owner 2014, Dodge Ram, 3500 Crew-Cab 4X4 Diesel 169" Laramie Longhorn Edition Listed For Sale at \$52,900.00 with 26,516 actual miles. Exhibit J3B is the Original Manufacturers Invoice Cost (\$59,478.00) and Manufacturers Suggested Retail Price (MSRP) (\$65,250.00) with all standard equipment and options for the above referenced 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab 4X4 Diesel 169" Laramie Longhorn. NADA Certified Pre-Owned Retail Value (see Exhibit J3C) for 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab 4X4 Diesel 169" Laramie Longhorn Edition Model is \$53,900.00. CarFax reports (see Exhibit J3D) the One-Owner 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab 4X4 Diesel 169" Laramie Longhorn Edition with a GREEN CHECK... No Accident/Damage is Reported, 1 Owner, with 0 Service Records and At Least 1 Open Recall, Regular Oil Changes, Worth \$420.00 Above Than Retail Book Value. CarFax Adjusted Retail Value is \$54,320.00.
Comparable J3, Vehicle Identification Number:3C63RRKL0EG263100 Mileage: 26,516

Vehicle Value Experts thru their Data Base has located three (3) 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab Diesel 169" Laramie Longhorn Edition Models (see Exhibit K, Texas Factual Sales One-Owner 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab 4X4 Diesel 169" Laramie Longhorn Edition Models with Clean CarFax Report) with Clean CarFax Reports and mileage between 11,345 and 45,498 that sold between August and September of 2015 in Texas. Vehicle Value Experts Data Base contains every sales transaction that has been registered in Texas. The only 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab Diesel 169" Laramie Longhorn Edition Model Sales in Texas between August and October 2015 were (4X4) Four Wheel Drive and Mega-Cab Models. There were No Sales of 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab Diesel 169" Laramie Longhorn Edition (4X2) Two Wheel Drive Models for August thru October 2015 in Texas to use as a factual comparable.

VEHICLE VALUE EXPERTS COMPARABLE K1: Comparable K1 (see Exhibit K1A, Texas Department of Motor Vehicle Redacted Sales Tax Receipt) had 11,345 miles and sold by Dallas Dodge in Dallas, Texas on August 5, 2015, for \$54,902.12. Exhibit K1B is the Original Manufacturers Invoice Cost (\$58,861.00) and Manufacturers Suggested Retail Price (MSRP) (\$64,525.00) with all standard equipment and options for the above referenced 2014 Dodge Ram

3500 Crew-Cab 4X4 Diesel 169" Laramie Longhorn. NADA Certified Pre-Owned Retail Value (see Exhibit K1C) for 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab 4X4 Diesel 169" Laramie Longhorn Edition is \$55,300.00. CarFax reports (see Exhibit K1D) the 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab 4X4 Diesel 169" Laramie Longhorn Edition with a GREEN CHECK... No Accident/Damage is Reported, 2 Previous Owners, with 0 Service Records, Regular Oil Changes and At Least 1 Open Recall, Worth \$120.00 Above Retail Book Value. CarFax Adjusted Retail Value is \$55,420.00. Comparable K1, Vehicle Identification Number: 3C63RRKL8EG304427 Mileage: 11,345

VEHICLE VALUE EXPERTS COMPARABLE K2: Comparable K2 (see Exhibit K2A, Texas Department of Motor Vehicle Redacted Sales Tax Receipt) had 45,498 miles and sold by Love Field Dodge in Dallas, Texas on August 22, 2015, for \$55,999.00. Exhibit K2B is the Original Manufacturers Invoice Cost (\$58,861.00) and Manufacturers Suggested Retail Price (MSRP) (\$64,525.00) with all standard equipment and options for the above referenced 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab 4X4 Diesel 169" Laramie Longhorn. NADA Certified Pre-Owned Retail Value (see Exhibit K2C) for 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab 4X4 Diesel 169" Laramie Longhorn Edition is \$52,200.00. CarFax reports (see Exhibit K2D) the 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab 4X4 Diesel 169" Laramie Longhorn Edition with a GREEN CHECK... No Accident/Damage is Reported, 2 Previous Owners, with 0 Service Records, Regular Oil Changes and At Least 1 Open Recall, Worth \$2,150.00 Above Retail Book Value. CarFax Adjusted Retail Value is \$54,350.00. Comparable K2, Vehicle Identification Number:3C63RRKL0EG183988 Mileage: 45,498

VEHICLE VALUE EXPERTS COMPARABLE K3: Comparable K3 (see Exhibit K3A, Texas Department of Motor Vehicle Redacted Sales Tax Receipt) had 13,882 miles and sold by CarMax in Houston, Texas on September 15, 2015, for \$53,998.00. Exhibit K3B is the Original Manufacturers Invoice Cost (\$58,861.00) and Manufacturers Suggested Retail Price (MSRP) (\$64,525.00) with all standard equipment and options for the above referenced 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab 4X4 Diesel 169" Laramie Longhorn. NADA Certified Pre-Owned Retail Value (see Exhibit K3C) for 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab 4X4 Diesel 169" Laramie Longhorn Edition is \$55,300.00. CarFax reports (see Exhibit K3D) the 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab 4X4 Diesel 169" Laramie Longhorn Edition with a GREEN CHECK... No Accident/Damage is Reported, 2 Previous Owners, with 0 Service Records and At Least 1 Open Recall, Worth \$630.00 Below Retail Book Value. CarFax Adjusted Retail Value is \$54,670. Comparable K3, Vehicle Identification Number: 3C63RRKL3EG285883 Mileage: 13,882

2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab 4X2 6 Cylinder Diesel Laramie Longhorn Edition 169" that is the subject of this analysis Vin Code is **3C63RPKL0E** which translates to 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab 4X2 6 Cylinder Diesel Laramie Longhorn Edition 169". As noted in Exhibit F the Dodge Ram Vehicle Identification Number (VIN) Decoding Information. Listed below is the subject Dodge Ram Vehicle Identification Number (VIN) Decoded. Position 1-3 World Manufacturer Identifier **3C6** (Chrysler de Mexico Truck), Position 4 Brake System & Gross Vehicle Weight (GVWR) **3** (Hydraulic- 10,001-14,000 lbs.), Positions 5-7 defines Brand, Marketing Name, Drive Wheels, Cab/Body Type, Drive Position, and Prices Series **RPK** (2WD Crew-Cab Lon Bed Longhorn Edition), Position 8 Engine **L** (6.7 Liter 6 Cylinder Diesel), Position 9 Check Digit **0** (0 through 9 or X), Position 10 is Model Year **E** = 2014.

The 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab 4X4 6 Cylinder Diesel Laramie Longhorn Edition 169” Autotrader (see Exhibit J, Autotrader 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab Diesel 169” Laramie Longhorn Edition Models within a 500-mile radius of Kaufman Texas) and Vehicle Value Experts (see Exhibit K, Texas Factual Sales One-Owner 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab 4X4 Diesel 169” Laramie Longhorn Edition Models with Clean CarFax Report) Comparables Vin Code is **3C63RRKL** which translates to 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab 4X4 6 Cylinder Diesel Laramie Longhorn Edition 169”. As noted in Exhibit F the Dodge Ram Vehicle Identification Number (VIN) Decoding Information. The Dodge Ram Vehicle Identification Number (VIN) Decoded. Position 1-3 World Manufacturer Identifier **3C6** (Chrysler de Mexico Truck), Position 4 Brake System & Gross Vehicle Weight (GVWR) **3** (Hydraulic- 10,001-14,000 lbs.), Positions 5-7 defines Brand, Marketing Name, Drive Wheels, Cab/Body Type, Drive Position, and Prices Series **RRK** (4WD Crew-Cab Lon Bed Longhorn Edition), Position 8 Engine **L** (6.7 Liter 6 Cylinder Diesel), Position 9 Check Digit **0** (0 through 9 or X), Position 10 is Model Year **E** = 2014.

As noted and documented above there is No Exact Match 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab 4X2 Diesel 169” Laramie Longhorn Edition Comparables listed For Sale with Autotrader and/or No Factual Sales Comparables that have sold in Texas in the month of September and October of 2015. As referenced in Exhibit E, the Base MSRP for the 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab 4X2 Diesel 169” Laramie Longhorn Edition that is the subject of this analysis with a Vin Code of **3C63RPKL** is \$51,010.00. The 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab 4X4 6 Cylinder Diesel Laramie Longhorn Edition 169” Autotrader (see Exhibit J, Autotrader 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab Diesel 169” Laramie Longhorn Edition Models within a 500-mile radius of Kaufman Texas) and Vehicle Value Experts (see Exhibit K, Texas Factual Sales One-Owner 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab 4X4 Diesel 169” Laramie Longhorn Edition Models with Clean CarFax Report) Comparables Vin Code is **3C63RRKL**. As referenced in Exhibit J and K, the Base MSRP for the 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab 4X4 Diesel 169” Laramie Longhorn Edition that is the subject of this analysis with a Vin Code of **3C63RRKL** is \$54,045.00. The difference in MSRP ($\$51,010.00 - \$54,045.00 = \$3,035.00$) between 3C63RPKL (4X2) and 3C63RRKL is \$3,035.00.

Taking into account the above referenced supporting documents, vehicle identification number code variable, dealer added options, maintenance records, actual documented sales of 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab Diesel 169” Laramie Longhorn 4X2/4X4 Models in Texas between August and October of 2015, limited number of 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab Diesel 169” Laramie Longhorn 4X2/4X4 Models available with Dodge Certified Pre-Owned Certification currently available (November 2015) For Sale in the United States with Clean CarFax Reports. Vehicle Value Experts is of the professional opinion (see Exhibit P, Vehicle Value Experts Pre-Wreck Certified Appraisal) the November 2015 Fair Market Retail Value would have been \$53,900.00.

Date of Loss was November 1, 2015. Mileage was 38,022.

CCC ONE MARKET VALUATION REPORT COMPARABLES:

The CCC ONE MARKET VALUATION REPORT that is the subject of this analysis has five (5) (see Exhibit L, CCC ONE Comparables) mismatched (see Exhibit F, Dodge Ram Vehicle

Identification (VIN) Decoder) Dodge Ram 3500 4X2 Models (see Exhibit A, CCC ONE MARKET COMP EVALUATION) used to support the \$44,251.00 Base Vehicle Value. Why does CCC ONE choose to compare five (5) mismatched Rams when there are 3 or 4 that are almost the same as the 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab 4X2 Diesel 169" Laramie Longhorn Edition that is the subject of this analysis? The reason is, using many "comparable vehicles/sales with mismatched options, multiple owners, below standard service records and mileage" decreases the average asking/sale price. This is particularly true due to the fact the computer program "devalues" the Rams selected as "comparable" then in turn devalues your Ram on the basis of the devalued Rams. From the five (5) mismatched Ram Comps CCC ONE solely selected at their discretion, none are Laramie Longhorn Models with 6-Speed Auto Aisin AS69RC HD Transmissions or 3:73 Rear Axle Ratio, but not solely limited too. CCC ONE Valuation Methodology does not exactly appraise your Ram; they arrive at a Base Vehicle Value based on a Presumptive Number instead of actual factual sales transactions from like Ram's such as yours. If CCC ONE truly wanted to place a factual accurate Fair Market Value on your 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab 4X2 Diesel 169" Laramie Longhorn Edition they would find two or three very similar 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab 4X2 Diesel 169" Laramie Longhorn Edition Models with similar mileage and options that were in fact sold in your geographic marketplace, they would not search high and low for as many mismatched Rams of the approximate year, make and model as they can, toss out those they think sold for too much and then run an average based on a presumptive value of all these various mismatched models to arrive at what CCC One labels Base Vehicle Value.

At the end of this analysis, one could easily read CCC ONE does not, in fact, have the Claimants best financial interest in mind in regards to the above referenced Claim. As noted on page 1 of the CCC ONE MARKET VALUATION REPORT, "The CCC ONE Market Valuation Report reflects CCC's opinion as to the value of the loss vehicle. CCC ONE has been preparing market value reports for the insurance industry since 1981." [Emphases added]

CCC ONE COMPARABLE L1

2014 DODGE RAM 3500 CREW-CAB DIESEL 4X2 LARAMIE EDITION:

CCC ONE noted Seller as AutoNation in Spring, Texas and was Last Inspected on 7/13/2015 with a List Price of \$48,991.00 and mileage of 18,000. CCC ONE after their adjustments listed the Adjusted Value as \$43,942.00. Comparable L1 (see Exhibit L1A, Texas Department of Motor Vehicle Redacted Sales Tax Receipt) in fact had 18,916 miles and was sold by AutoNation in Spring, Texas on June 11, 2015, for \$46,753.00. Exhibit L1B is the Original Manufacturers Invoice Cost (\$43,343.00) and Manufacturers Suggested Retail Price (MSRP) (\$46,745.00) with all standard equipment and options for the above referenced 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab 4X2 Diesel 169" Laramie Edition. NADA Certified Pre-Owned Retail Value (see Exhibit L1C) for 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab 4X2 Diesel 169" Laramie Edition is \$49,100.00. CarFax reports (see Exhibit L1D) 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab 4X2 Diesel 169" Laramie Edition with a GREEN CHECK... No Accident/Damage is Reported, 2 Previous Owners, with 11 Service Records and At Least 1 Open Recall, Worth \$1,000.00 Below Retail Book Value. CarFax Adjusted Retail Value is \$48,100.00.

Comparable L1, Vehicle Identification Number:3C63RPJL6EG108069 Mileage: 18,916
How could CCC ONE have inspected the Truck on July 13, 2015, and spoke to Gonzalo Krosnyak at AutoNation in Spring, Texas and confirmed all options and List Price was

*\$48,991.00 and, in fact, the Truck was Sold on June 11, 2015, for \$46,753.00? CCC ONE Adjusted Value was referenced as \$43,942.00. [Emphases added]
There is no Scientific Data to support said computation by CCC ONE.*

CCC ONE COMPARABLE L2

2014 DODGE RAM 3500 CREW-CAB DIESEL 4X2 LARAMIE EDITION:

CCC ONE noted Seller as Signature Autos in Austin, Texas and was published on 9/2/2015 with a List Price of \$39,990.00 and mileage of 67,550. CCC ONE after their adjustments listed the Adjusted Value as \$44,655.00. Comparable L2 (see Exhibit L2A, Texas Department of Motor Vehicle Redacted Sales Tax Receipt) in fact had 67,623 miles and was sold by Signature Leasing in Austin, Texas on September 17, 2015, for \$39,990.00. Exhibit L2B is the Original Manufacturers Invoice Cost (\$43,343.00) and Manufacturers Suggested Retail Price (MSRP) (\$46,745.00) with all standard equipment and options for the above referenced 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab 4X2 Diesel 169" Laramie Edition. NADA Certified Pre-Owned Retail Value (see Exhibit L2C) for 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab 4X2 Diesel 169" Laramie Edition is \$42,375.00. CarFax reports (see Exhibit L2D) 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab 4X2 Diesel 169" Laramie Edition with a GREEN CHECK... No Accident/Damage is Reported, 2 previous Owners, with 7 Service Records and At Least 1 Open Recall, Worth \$910.00 Above Retail Book Value. CarFax Adjusted Retail Value is \$43,285.00.

Comparable L2, Vehicle Identification Number:3C63RPJL9EG123102 Mileage: 67,623

There is no Scientific Data to support said computation by CCC ONE.

CCC ONE COMPARABLE L3

2014 DODGE RAM 3500 CREW-CAB DIESEL 4X2 LARAMIE EDITION:

CCC ONE noted Seller as Chastang Chrysler Dodge in Angleton, Texas and was published on 11/5/2015 with a List Price of \$45,983.00 and mileage of 32,059. CCC ONE after their adjustments listed the Adjusted Value as \$43,872.00. Comparable L3 (see Exhibit L3A, Chastang Chrysler Dodge Jeep Ram website listing of said Ram) is listed with 32,059 miles and listed For Sale for \$45,962.00. Exhibit L3B is the Original Manufacturers Invoice Cost (\$43,343.00) and Manufacturers Suggested Retail Price (MSRP) (\$46,745.00) with all standard equipment and options for the above referenced 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab 4X2 Diesel 169" Laramie Edition. NADA Certified Pre-Owned Retail Value (see Exhibit L3C) for 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab 4X2 Diesel 169" Laramie Edition is \$46,775.00. CarFax reports (see Exhibit L3D) 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab 4X2 Diesel 169" Laramie Edition with a GREEN CHECK... No Accident/Damage is Reported, 1 Owner, with 8 Service Records and At Least 1 Open Recall, Worth \$900.00 Above Retail Book Value. CarFax Adjusted Retail Value is \$47,675.00.

Comparable L3, Vehicle Identification Number:3C63RPJL9EG130261 Mileage: 32,059

There is no Scientific Data to support said computation by CCC ONE.

CCC ONE COMPARABLE L4

2014 DODGE RAM 3500 CREW-CAB DIESEL 4X2 LARAMIE EDITION:

CCC ONE noted Seller as Sandoval Buick GMC in Columbus, Ohio and was published on 10/30/2015 with a List Price of \$46,669.00 and mileage of 14,500. CCC ONE after their adjustments listed the Adjusted Value as \$41,273.00. Comparable L4 as of November 24, 2015, is not listed For Sale on Sandoval Buick GMC website. Exhibit L4A is the Original

Manufacturers Invoice Cost (\$43,343.00) and Manufacturers Suggested Retail Price (MSRP) (\$46,745.00) with all standard equipment and options for the above referenced 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab 4X2 Diesel 169" Laramie Edition. NADA Certified Pre-Owned Retail Value (see Exhibit L4B) for 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab 4X2 Diesel 169" Laramie Edition is \$47,025.00. CarFax reports (see Exhibit L4C) 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab 4X2 Diesel 169" Laramie Edition with a GREEN CHECK... No Accident/Damage is Reported, 1 Owner, with 5 Service Records and At Least 1 Open Recall, Worth \$760.00 Above Retail Book Value. CarFax Adjusted Retail Value is \$47,785.00.

Comparable L3, Vehicle Identification Number:3C63RPJL2EG220013 Mileage: 14,500

There is no Scientific Data to support said computation by CCC ONE.

CCC ONE COMPARABLE L5

2014 DODGE RAM 3500 CREW-CAB DIESEL 4X2 LARAMIE EDITION:

CCC ONE noted Seller as Stingray Chevrolet in Bartow, Florida and was published on 7/29/2015 with a List Price of \$49,980.00 and mileage of 13,716. CCC ONE after their adjustments listed the Adjusted Value as \$44,336.00. Comparable L5 as of November 24, 2015, is not listed For Sale on Stingray Chevrolet website. Exhibit L5A is the Original Manufacturers Invoice Cost (\$43,343.00) and Manufacturers Suggested Retail Price (MSRP) (\$46,745.00) with all standard equipment and options for the above referenced 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab 4X2 Diesel 169" Laramie Edition. NADA Certified Pre-Owned Retail Value (see Exhibit L5B) for 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab 4X2 Diesel 169" Laramie Edition is \$48,350.00. CarFax reports (see Exhibit L5C) 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab 4X2 Diesel 169" Laramie Edition with a GREEN CHECK... No Accident/Damage is Reported, 2 Previous Owners, with 1 Service Records and At Least 1 Open Recall, Worth \$160.00 Above Retail Book Value. CarFax Adjusted Retail Value is \$48,510.00.

Comparable L3, Vehicle Identification Number:3C63RPJL8EG278515 Mileage: 13,716

There is no Scientific Data to support said computation by CCC ONE.

CCC ONE has discredited their Market Valuation Report by and through the mix matching of 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab Models; allowing low add for model variance's; populating in comparison Rams with improper drive trains and transmissions; misrepresenting information, details and options on the Comparables and making it next to impossible to verify the information given on the Comparable Vehicles, but not solely limited too.

We suppose one must feel some comfort and trust in CCC ONE since "CCC has been preparing market value reports for the insurance industry since 1981." [Emphasis mine]

After examining each documented factual point listed above, it would be difficult if not impossible to place any value and/or credence on The CCC ONE MARKET VALUATION REPORT Base Vehicle Value of \$44,251.00 for the One-Owner 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab 4X2 Diesel 169" Laramie Longhorn Edition that is the subject of this analysis.

Exhibit M is the Preliminary Repair Estimate written by Foremost County Mutual Insurance Company to repair the 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab 4X2 Diesel 169" Laramie Longhorn Edition back to its Pre-Wreck Condition of \$16,330.06.

Exhibit N, are photos of the One-Owner 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab 4X2 Diesel 169” Laramie Longhorn Edition with 38,022 miles that are the subject of this analysis before the collision damage occurred.

Exhibit O, are photos of the wrecked and/or collision damaged One-Owner 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab 4X2 Diesel 169” Laramie Longhorn Edition with 38,022 miles that are the subject of this analysis.

CONCLUSION:

Auto Body News Magazine December 2015 Vol.33 Issue 12, “Determining Value for Total Loss Vehicles Often Complicated and Controversial,” contacted the Insurance Information Institute (I.I.I.), a New York City-based consumer education organization that is funded by the insurance industry. “Most standard auto policies will not pay to repair a vehicle if the repairs cost more than the cash value assigned to the car,” said Michael Barry, vice president, media relations if I.I.I.

“For you to get a settlement higher than the book value of your car’s make and model, you will have to submit evidence such as mileage records, service history and affidavits from mechanics to show that your car was worth more. You’re entitled to the market price of the car you just lost. You shouldn’t get more or less than you are do.”

Mr. Gillispie after carefully taking into consideration the limited pristine One-Owner 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab 4X2 Diesel 169” Laramie Longhorn Edition Models available For Sale in The United States; reviewing all of the above information; documents, dealer adds, detail maintenance records, and condition of your One-Owner 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab 4X2 Diesel 169” Laramie Longhorn Edition that is the subject of this analysis. It is our Professional Opinion, The Fair Market Value (see Exhibit P, One-Owner 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab 4X2 Diesel 169” Laramie Longhorn Edition Certified Appraisal) of the above referenced One-Owner 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab 4X2 Diesel 169” Laramie Longhorn Edition before the wreck was \$53,900.00 at or around November of 2015. The One-Owner 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab 4X2 Diesel 169” Laramie Longhorn Edition that is the subject of this analysis prior to the accident would have been a sought after 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab 4X2 Diesel 169” Laramie Longhorn Edition Model in the Retail Market Place around The United States and would easily have sold for a Retail Amount in excess of \$53,900.00 as documented in the above referenced comparables and exhibits. Buyers could expect to see an Average Dealer and/or Private Seller Asking Price for a Certified Pre-Owned 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab 4X2 Diesel 169” Laramie Longhorn Edition of between \$53,900.00 to \$55,900.00 when available with low to average mileage, Clean CarFax Report and Excellent Documented Service Records.

In Closing Vehicle Value, Experts has laid out and fortified the Factual Fair Market Vehicle Value for the pristine One-Owner 2014 Dodge Ram 3500 Crew-Cab 4X2 Diesel 169” Laramie Longhorn listed above is, in fact, \$53,900.00. Please feel free to contact us for any further comments and/or supporting documents as they may relate.

Sincerely, Robert L. McDorman